

**Comments on: “Proposal for Raman x-ray free electron laser” by
Ph. Balcou, Eur. Phys. J. D 59, 525 (2010)^a**

A. Zholents¹,

*¹Advanced Photon Source, Argonne National Laboratory
Argonne, IL 60439*

M. Zolotarev²

*²Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory,
Berkeley, CA 94720*

The submitted manuscript has been created by UChicago Argonne, LLC, Operator of Argonne National Laboratory (“Argonne”). Argonne, a U.S. Department of Energy Office of Science laboratory, is operated under Contract No. DE-AC02-06CH11357. The U.S. Government retains for itself, and others acting on its behalf, a paid-up nonexclusive, irrevocable worldwide license in said article to reproduce, prepare derivative works, distribute copies to the public, and perform publicly and display publicly, by or on behalf of the Government.

Submitted to European Physics Journal D

^aWork supported by the U. S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Office of Basic Energy Sciences, under Contract No. DE-AC02-06CH11357.

Comments on:

“Proposal for Raman x-ray free electron laser”

by Ph. Balcou,

Eur. Phys. J. D 59, 525 (2010)

A. Zholents¹, and M. Zolotarev²

¹Advanced Photon Source, Argonne National Laboratory, 9700 South Cass Avenue, Argonne, IL 60439,
e-mail: azholents@aps.anl.gov

²Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, 1 Cyclotron Road, Berkeley, CA 94720

Submitted 9/15/2010

Equation (13) in this paper defines the force experienced by the electron moving in z direction with velocity v_z due to the x-ray wave propagating in the z direction, with electric field E_1 pointing in the y direction, and magnetic field B_1 pointing in the x direction as

$$\vec{F}_1(t) = -eE_1 \cos(\omega_1 t - k_1 z) \vec{e}_y. \quad (1)$$

In our opinion, when calculating this force one should also include the impact of the x-ray wave's magnetic field and obtain

$$\vec{F}_1(t) = -e(E_1 - \frac{v_z}{c} B_1) \cos(\omega_1 t - k_1 z) \vec{e}_y \approx -\frac{eE_1}{2\gamma^2} \cos(\omega_1 t - k_1 z) \vec{e}_y \quad (2)$$

Here c is the speed of light and γ is the electron relativistic factor. As a result, one would need to change E_1 to $E_1/2\gamma^2$ in all the following equations in the cited paper (except the wave propagation equations Eq. (23) and Eq. (34)). We believe that a similar omission of the impact of the magnetic field appears in Eq. (28). Consequently, the formula for the gain (Eq. (37) in the cited paper) should also include the factor $1/2\gamma^2$. This is a rather significant modification considering that relativistic electrons with values of γ ranging from approximately 20 to approximately 300 are used in the numerical examples.